Submitter: MIKE SLAGLE

On Behalf Of:

Committee: House Committee On Rules

Measure, Appointment or Topic: HB3166

HB 3166 - what is Ranked Choice Voting? Here's a simple illustration to explain why you should vote NO!??????

A group of 100 people vote on dessert. The choices are:
-Brownies
-Apple Pie
-Brussel sprouts
-Peas

The votes come in:
49 people vote for Brownies,
24 in favor of Apple Pie,
17 in favor of Brussel Sprouts, and
10 for Peas.

Peas are out, but all 10 of those voters chose Brussel Sprouts as their 2nd choice, so the next tally is 49 for Brownies, 27 for Brussel Sprouts, and 24 for Apple Pie. Now Apple Pie is out, but as luck would have it all of the Apple Pie voters had Peas as their 2nd choice, but since Peas was already eliminated it went to their 3rd place vote which was, you guessed it, Brussel Sprouts.

Our final tally:
Brussel Sprouts 51
Brownies 49.

The 49 Brownies lovers hate Brussel Sprouts and chose them as their 4th place pick, but they like Apple Pie and chose it as their 2nd place pick. The 17 people who chose Brussel sprouts as their 1st place vote all had Brownies as their 2nd choice, but since Brussel Sprouts was never eliminated those 2nd place votes were never tallied.

So Brownies, with 49 1st place votes, 17 2nd place votes and only 24 4th place votes, loses to Brussel Sprouts that won 17 1st place votes, 10 2nd place votes, 24 3rd place votes and 49 4th place votes. But Apple Pie also had 73 1st and 2nd choice votes. The only people really happy in this scenario are the 17 people that really really like Brussel Sprouts, and maybe 10 more that think they're "ok".

Does a system that allows for this possibility sound like a good system? Brownies won 66 1st and 2nd place votes while Brussel sprouts only got 27 1st and 2nd place

votes. And poor Apple Pie received 73 1st and 2nd place votes and eliminated in the 2nd round! RCV fails to consider 2nd choice preferences for the last eliminated and the winner, giving more weight to fewer 2nd or 3rd choices.

This is why people say that RCV is unfair ??

It counts SOME people's 2nd, 3rd, or 4th place votes while not counting others. Furthermore, in the final tally, one person's begrudging 3rd or 4th place vote CARRIES JUST AS MUCH WEIGHT as another person's 1st place preference.

VOTE NO on HB 3166!!!